

A CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF SEXISM IN THE 9TH GRADE EFL TEXTBOOKS FOR LONG-DISTANCE LEARNING IN INDONESIA

Vincentia Yovita Purwitasari¹, Tri Wahyuni Floriasti²

^{1,2} Yogyakarta State University

¹vyovita97@gmail.com,

²triwahyunifloriasti.uny.ac.id

Abstract

This study followed a content analysis research design. It employs the three stages of Fairclough's three-dimensional analysis: description, interpretation, and explanation. In the description stage, this study analyzes the frequency of female and male occurrences, the title of female and males, the pictorial representation of females and males, the masculine pronoun tendency, activities, and social-domestic roles. After the description stages, the analysis moved on to the interpretation of social and intertextual context. Finally, the analysis moved in to explanation stage where this study analyze the result in relation to gain critical explanation on the macro level. The findings of this study revealed that the textbooks followed a sexism attitude of gender marginalization, gender subordination, gender stereotype, cultural sexism, and labor segregation by sex. The textbooks biased toward the females by representing females less than males in occurrence by 59,3% and 57,6% pictorial representation; it also used the title Mr and Ma'am inconsistently.; there were also 10 evidence of masculine pronoun tendency, representation of activities and the social-domestic roles that perpetuate female subordination and *housewifization*.

Keywords: CDA, sexism, texbooks, gender equality, long-distance learning, EFL

INTRODUCTION

The development of Critical Discourse Analysis and Gender Studies has challenged the English Language Education to follow the development of English Language along with the changes in society, especially gender equality movement and critical language study. According to ACDP report in 2013, Indonesia has signed several conventions regarding to the gender equality: the 2000 Dakar Declaration regarding Education for All (EFA), the 1995 Beijing Platform for Action, the 2000 UN Millennium Declaration, and UN Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). The gender mainstreaming has also been institutionalized in Indonesia and its education

through the signing of Presidential Decree (Inpres) No 9/2000 on Gender Mainstreaming in the national Development Planning and Programming and Kemendikbud 84/2008. Despite the Gender Mainstreaming program, there are still evidence of gender wage gap (Suharyono & Digidowiseso, 2020) and harassment toward females in Education institutions (Harsono, 2021). The phenomena cannot be separated from the cultural violence (Galtung in Ercoşkun, 2020). Drawing from that notion, the teaching and learning of Language cannot be separated from the changing of language.

The teaching of English Language cannot be separated from the learning materials. Richards (2001), recognizes the use of materials as "the basis for

much of the language input learners receive and the language practice that occurs in the classroom". Textbooks as one of the learning materials are particularly interesting. We refer to the Klerides (2010) writing that proposes the textbooks as both a genre and a discourse. Textbook as genre poses its role as "conventionalized way" (Klerides, 2010:41). Meanwhile, the textbook as a discourse imposes the role of textbook in relation to the critical awareness. As Klerides (2010: 37) puts it, "the discourse of any given textbook produce, reproduce, and sustains; challenges, transforms, and dismantles reality in certain ways". This study will focus on the role of textbooks as discourse. This study tried to answer two research question: (1) Based on the relevant theories, what sexism do the textbooks represent? and (2) How, to what extent, is sexism represented in the textbooks?

Gender, Sexism and Language

To understand gender, we must understand the distinction between gender and sex. Fakhri (2015) describing sex as the characterization and the differences between two sexes in humans as it seems biologically determined. However, Fakhri's view of sex is deemed to be challenged. Butler in her *Gender Trouble* writing (1999: 10-11) also proposes a question, "if the immutable character of sex is contested, perhaps this construct called 'sex' is as culturally constructed as the gender [...]". The issue is then not whether the biological explanation, but rather the idea and social construction that is surrounding and determine the sex and the association of it. Butler (1998), proposes the idea that gender is performative. Then, the gender reality according to Butler (1988) is concealing performative gender through sustaining the social performance according to sex.

The word "sexism" is frequently used to describe the surface manifestation of ide that persons or people are inferior because of their sex or gender (Council of Europe, n.d.). However, the term "sexism" and "gender inequality" is preferred in this study to refer both the surface manifestation and the system of sexism. According to Fakhri, (2015), there are several manifestations of gender inequalities that are related and dialectical, namely:

marginalization, subordination, stereotype, violence, and burden.

Marginalization is related to "impoverishment" (Fakhri, 2015). The impoverishment can be done by social exclusion. The marginalization can be imposed by the government's policy, religious beliefs, and culture in the society, and/or in the academic.

The next one is gender subordination. According to Fakhri (2015), gender assumption can be the source of subordination. Subordination according to Fakhri (2015) is the assumption that one gender has a greater position and greater position than others. Subordinations can cause one group to have the least social resource than the other. The examples of subordination in Indonesia are illustrated in Suryakusuma's (2011) writing. The "Ibu" is often addressed to the high-status women: wealthy women, educated women, and women with high profession. However, in State Ibumism, women status is still lower than her husband and her power are derived from the marital status.

The third one is gender stereotype. The stereotyping involving gender aspect—gender stereotyping—can include the over generalized-conception of gender characteristics and roles. Stereotyping can cause a limit in personal development and personal characteristic (Cook & Cusack, 2010). Talbot (in Holmes and Mayerhoff, 2003) recognizes that stereotyping can involve simplification, reduction, and naturalization.

The fourth one is gender violence. Here The violence cannot only be scrutinized into attacks or assaults on physical, sexual, economical, and/or psychological aspects as Fakhri (2015). The violence term adopted in this study here involving Galtung's (1990) categorization of violence that include direct, structural, and cultural violence. Mainly this study will focus on the cultural violence. Cultural violence includes psychological mechanism

changing and justifying one's morale and acts. This type of violence can include religion and ideology, language and art, empirical and formal science (logic, mathematics) to justify direct or structural violence. Including language sanitation and sexist language.

The last one is in relation of burden. Here this study refer to Mies's (1981) labour segregation by sex and the notion of double burden. As society develops capitalistic modes of production, the domestic role is externalized to reduce the cost. Thus, women's domestic job is regarded as unpaid creating economic power imbalance. This process is continued on even when women start to enter workforce. This concept of both taking the labor in the workforce and in the domestic area is what is often called "The Double Burden".

As from theories about gender adopted above on gender, the performativity theory relates to the causal relation of gendered life and the language (speech act) (Conrod, 2020: 5). This view then bring to the This view then claims that the speech acts, relating to how we describe, differentiate, claim, and identify bodies, are part of the attempt to impose sexed categories and gendered subjects. The example from that include the struggle to use of "they" as singular pronoun rather than "he" to describe non gendered epicene pronoun. The use of "he" to describe non gendered pronoun suggests that women were excluded from the discussion as men were the default of the language.

CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS, AND FAIRCLOUGH'S FRAMEWORK

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) bridges social study with the language. The "critical" in CDA here brings the mean to "explore hidden power" (Rogers, 2004). Moreover, discourse in CDA is seen to relation with the social practice as Fairclough (2015) said that it deals with the production of discourse but also how discourse is interpreted and reproduced. There are three most popular approaches in CDA: Faiclough's framework, Van Dijk's framework, and Wodak's framework. Fairclough's framework is regarded interesting in this study because of its socio-cultural approach and the explanation stage to grasp, not only the text, but also the social-institutional situation related.

Fairclough (2015) recognizes "reproduction of discourse" and "inculcation" attempting to "recreate the universality and naturalness" by power holders to preserve their power. If there is an effort of Gender mainstreaming realized by the Indonesian Government in Education (English Language Education in particular), an effort of undoing sexism must be realized. In that case, include cultural sexism. Fairclough (2015) recognizes "reproduction of discourse" and "inculcation". As discourse is seen as social practice, discourse—orders of discourse—seek to maintain the power relation in the stable changing world. Inculcation in Fairclough's writing (2015:99) is related to an attempt to "recreate the universality and naturalness" by power holders to preserve their power. According to Fairclough, the progress of reproduction and inculcation of ideology and ideas, in a relatively stable non-conflict condition, is usually by consent or in a largely hidden fashion. Combining that notion with the role of textbooks as the medium of learning, the exposure of language models, and part of English language teaching-learning, it becomes important to analyze the textbooks regarding to the sexism.

Fairclough's framework is known as Three-Dimensional Analysis. It involves process of critical discourse analysis in three dimensions: Description, Interpretation, and Explanation. Description deals with the formal properties of a text such as vocabulary, grammar, and textual structure in the values of experiential (content), relational (social relationship), and expressive (subject and social identities). In the next stage, Interpretation deals with interaction of text as product and as a resource of interpretation. The interpretation process in this framework highlights the situational context and intertextual context. Finally, the last stage—Explanation—deals with macro perspective that is portraying discourse as part of social process, finding the

reproductive effects of discourse on structure and how it sustains or changing them.

METHODOLOGY

This study employed the qualitative content analysis technique. As explained by Ary *et al.* (2010: 458), “Content analyses may be done in an *emergent design framework...*”. Following the statement, for the analysis, the study adapted Fairclough’s (2015) three-dimensional model of critical discourse analysis. However, to gain further perspective in the Gender studies, this study adopted 6 of 8 analysis points by Amerian and Esmaili (2015), that are: (1) finding the ratio of the frequency of females to males and the similarities between them, (2) finding the title attached to both sexes, (3) finding the frequency of females and males in pictorial representations, (4) finding the evidence of masculine generic construction, (5) finding the females’ and males’ social and domestic roles, (6) finding the representation of both sexes in relation with the activities they attend. Therefore, the study will examine the sexism in the textbooks based on Fairclough’s Critical Discourse Analysis. Next, the data then were processed using quantitative computational to determine the tendency. After the result were found, this study moved on to analysis using Fairclough’s framework of qualitative interpretation in relation with the social context and intertextual context. Finally, the explanation then was conducted to see the text in relation of the macro context of social process, social practice, and how it is determined and determining by social structure and the reproductive process.

The data of this study research were taken from Long-Distance Learning Textbooks publish by the government that include (1) “Modul Pembelajaran Jarak Jauh Pada Masa Pandemi COVID-19 untuk Jenjang SMP: Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Inggris- Kelas IX Semester Gasal” and (2) Modul Pembelajaran Jarak Jauh Pada Masa Pandemi COVID-19 untuk Jenjang SMP: Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Inggris- Kelas IX Semester Genap”. The textbooks were chosen for analysis based on the following justification: (1) The textbooks are government-funded and contributing to the aspect of legitimization; (2) The textbooks are accessible widely to most Indonesian Students; (3) The textbooks’ role in providing structure

concerning the curriculum is strengthened due to the context of the textbooks. To collect the data, first of all the books were retrived from Kemendikbud repository website. After that, the researchers read the textbooks. After that, the researchers document the dialogs, exercises, illustrations, and reading passages for analysis. From that, the data were coded and presented into the tables of data collection sheet.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

Description

This section deals with Fairclough’s (2015) Description stage. This part presents the result of analysis from 6 points analysis by Amerian and Emaili’s (2015) and describes the findings.

Occurences

Book	Female Occurrences	Male Occurrences	Total
Modul PJJ Gasal	128 (53,8%)	110 (46,2%)	238
Modul PJJ Genap	82 (29,5%)	196 (70,5%)	278
Total	210 (40,7%)	306 (59,3%)	516

The analysis of occurrences finds that in total, the females were not equally represented compared to the number of male occurrences. The frequency of female occurrences is 40,7% compared to male occurrences by 59,3%. The overall result of female occurrences frequency doesn’t come in favour of the females. The issue which was being addressed by doing the occurrences are the issues of bias by omission (Amerian & Esmaili, 2015). This goes hand-in-hand with the concept of gender marginalization as a form of social exclusion—including one sex and excluding the other. Thus, there is a bias toward females by the occurrences of in the text. The less occurrence of females implying less participation of female in discourse.

However, the results in Modul PJJ Gasal were in favour of females compared to males. In a glimpse, it looks like the

Fixing electronic	0	3
Gathering	0	2
Granting wishes	0	1
Housekeeping	30	0
Hunting	0	2
Parenting	24	0
Playing	0	1
Ruling	0	4
Selling	0	3
Social working	1	0
Story telling	3	1
Threading	3	0
Travelling	1	4
Woodcrafting	1	0
Working	1	7
Writing	6	5
Total	89	80
Percentage	52,7%	47,3%

Analysing the activities shows the participation of the activity males and females attend. This analysis highlights the division of labour by sex as explained by Mies (1981) that women are socially defined to do the house-bound activities and men were supposed to be the “bread-winner”.

From analysing the type of activities females and males attend to, the study found that the female most frequent activities in the textbooks are housekeeping and parenting. Meanwhile, the most frequent activities attended by males are producing music and working.

The tendency of female activities revolves around the house and parenting strengthen the evidence of State Ibuism and housewifization.

Social-Domestic

	Social	Domestic
Male Monopolized	58 (75,3%)	4 (5,6 %)
Male Dominated	2 (2,6%)	1 (1,4 %)

Gender shared	1 (1,3 %)	1 (1,4 %)
Female monopolized	11 (14,3 %)	63 (88,7%)
Female Dominated	5 (6,5%)	2 (2,8 %)

Social and Domestic roles address the issues of the stereotype of male domination and division of labour by sex. The results showed that, overall, the social roles were represented in favor of males, the frequency of social roles always higher in males especially the male monopolized by 75%. Meanwhile the female monopolized activities were higher in the domestic activities by 63%. Although the social roles were also significant in the social by 6,5%.

Thus, this finding showed that the textbooks try to represent female more in the domestic roles, while the males are in social roles.

Interpretation

Fairclough emphasizes the analysis of situational context and intertextual context as the central of interpretation. Thus, the situational context and intertextual context of the textbooks are discussed here.

The Modul PJJ Gasal and Modul PJJ Genap followed learning material genre in its way. The textbook becomes one of learning materials, the textbooks exist in the learning context and educational context. The theme of the book is supposed to relate to the previous knowledge and the situational context of when the textbooks were published. The absence of physical class is hindered in the pandemic, the control of the teacher as figure of authority changes. This textbook becomes a guidance as the learning standard changes due to the pandemic situation. In relation to that, the monopoly of legitimate education mentioned by (Wertsch, 2002) is then still apparent even though the learning environment changes. This way the state still has

significant control in controlling the identity and the narratives.

The materials—language models especially—in the textbooks were also adapted from various sources. That being said, modifications are done by the author to adapt to the language especially in the Modul PJJ Gasal. There are five narratives text that tends to see marriage as the resolution plot in 5 of the following texts: Mah Bongsu and the snake, Rapunzel, The Princess and The Dragon, The Princess and the Giant Bird, Jaka Tarub and Nawang Wulan. There are also adaptations to in the following narratives: Jaka Tarub and Nawang Wulan ended in happy marriage of Jaka Tarub and Nawang Wulan; Malin Kundang ended in at the mother being the breadwinner and doing domestic roles. In addition to that, there are also evidence of punishing-reward to follow housewifization in the Bawang Merah and Bawang Putih and Mah Bongsu and the Snake. In the Modul PJJ Genap, there are also evidence of irony in presenting mother by saying that mother “has her own authoritative power” but then the lyrics that relates to that is “She’s the lady of the house”.

The problems mentioned above follows a similar pattern to the womanhood construction in the New Order, State Ibuism. The emphasis of domestication on the women is represented in the result of activities analysis and social domestic analysis. The next one is the subordination of women by seeing women’s power are derived from men and inherited by marital status with high power men. This is shown in the pattern in the PJJ Modul Gasal that shows the resolution involves marriage with the higher status men, or in Suryakusumah’s (2011) writing “priyayization”. Thus, a similar pattern exists for the reason of maintaining the concept of bapak-ibuism, and hierarchal power relationship.

Explanation

The problem is the sexism represented in the textbooks: marginalization, subordination, stereotyping, cultural violence, and labour (double burden and labor segregation). As the book is published by the Ministry of Education and Culture, the institutional process it belongs to is the government. The educational context in which

it exists brings a sense of justification and legitimation. This is in contrary with the gender mainstreaming convention that Indonesian government has signed. The inculcation aspect of the textbooks is perpetuating “in the hidden fashion” by recontextualizing the sexism and maintaining the similar power relation—capitalistic, feudalistic, and sexist—as the State Ibuism ideology in the New Order Era.

The problem is then cannot be unsolved. The discursive mechanism can be solved with a communication mechanism rather than inculcation. The gender mainstreaming and critical language study is the effort to open the communication in the discourse regarding to sexism.

CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

Conclusion

From the findings it can be concluded that both textbooks—Modul Pembelajaran Jarak Jauh Gasal and Genap—follow a sexism attitude of gender marginalization, gender subordination, gender stereotype, cultural sexism, and labor segregation by sex. There are several ways the sexism is embedded that is via the occurrences that are biased toward female and in favour of male by 59,3%, the inconsistency title of Mr and Ma’am, the masculine pronoun tendency in 10 occurrences, the pictorial representations that is in favour of male only by 57,6%, the activities and the social roles that perpetuate female in domestic roles and house-bound activity.

Suggestions

This study like any other study in education must justify its significance to the pedagogical teachers. Regarding to that, this study recommends that there must be a critical approach regarding to gender and sexuality. Critical Language Awareness along with Critical Gender Awareness must be implemented not only in the Gender Mainstreaming School Pioneers but also in other schools and other aspect of education. There is also suggestion to adopt a more gender-friendly ESL/EFL texts and also including Critical Language Awareness and

Critical Gender Awareness in the form of additional facts when presenting a heavy-sexism text. The researchers also recognize the role of teacher in managing learning materials. Thus, teachers are expected to see if there is such example of sexism in the material, it can also be accommodated with the critical language awareness and critical gender awareness from the teacher. Lastly The researchers of this study believe the concepts and definition of gender cannot be separated with the society and diversity in the society. From the publication of Alfred Kinsey, the development of post-structuralist queer theory, and the new language studies on nonbinary pronoun, English language has grown into taking issues of gender equality. Even though this study focused on sexism from gender binary between men and women. The underrepresentation and the oppressive narrative against all gender spectrum must be taken into consideration especially by Indonesia's education. The author highly suggests more studies on language and education of LGBT, Queer and Non-Binary must be taken into consideration as part of resistance against sexist cultures especially in Indonesian and South-East Asian context.

REFERENCES

- [1] ACDP. (2013). *Review of a Decade of Gender Mainstreaming in Education in Indonesia*. Ministry of National Development Planning/National Development Planning Agency (BAPPENAS). Retrieved from: <https://www.adb.org/publications/review-decade-gender-mainstreaming-education-indonesia>
- [2] Amerian, M., & Esmaili, F. (2014). Language and gender: A critical discourse analysis on gender representation in a series of international ELT textbooks. *International Journal of Research Studies in Education*, 4(2). <https://doi.org/10.5861/ijrse.2014.963>
- [3] Butler, J. (1988). Performative Acts and Gender Constitution: An Essay in Phenomenology and Feminist Theory. *Theatre Journal*, 40(4), 519-531. doi:10.2307/3207893
- [4] Butler, J. (1999) *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. Routledge Press
- [5] Conrod, K. (2020). Pronouns and Gender in Language. *The Oxford Handbook of Language and Sexuality*. Published. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780190212926.013.63>
- [6] Cook, R. J., & Cusack, S. (2011). *Gender Stereotyping: Transnational Legal Perspectives (Pennsylvania Studies in Human Rights)* (Annotated ed.). University of Pennsylvania Press
- [7] Ercoşkun, B. (2020). On Galtung's Approach to Peace Studies. *Lectio Socialis*. Published. <https://doi.org/10.47478/lectio.792847>
- [8] Fairclough, N. (2015). *Language and Power* (Third Edition). Oxon & New York: Routledge.
- [9] Fakhri, M. (2015). *Analisis Gender dan Transformasi Sosial*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- [10] Galtung, J. (1990). Cultural Violence. *Journal of Peace Research*, 27(3), 291-305. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022343390027003005>
- [11] Klerides, E. (2010). Imagining the Textbook: Textbooks as Discourse and Genre. *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society*, 2(1). doi:10.3167/jemms.2010.020103
- [12] Suharyono, S & Digdowiseiso, K. (2021). Retracted: Education and gender wage gap: Evidence from Indonesia. *Accounting*, 7(1), 33-40.
- [13] Harsono, A., & McMinn, T. (2021). *I Wanted to Run Away*. Human Rights Watch. Retrieved from: <https://www.hrw.org/report/2021/03/18/i-wanted-run-away/abusive-dress-codes-women-and-girls-indonesia>
- [14] Machin, D., & Mayr, A. (2012). *How to Do Critical Discourse Analysis: A Multimodal Introduction* (1st ed.). SAGE Publications Ltd.
- [15] Mies, M. (1981). *The Social Origins of the Sexual Division of Labour*. Institute of Social Studies.
- [16] Moleong, J. L. (2012). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.

- [17] Richards, J. C. (2001). *Curriculum Development in Language Teaching (Cambridge Language Education)* (1st ed.). Cambridge University Press.
- [18] Rogers, R. (2004). *An Introduction to Critical Discourse Analysis in Education*. Routledge
- [19] Roohani, A., & Heidari, N. (2012). Evaluating an Instructional Textbook: A Critical Discourse Perspective. *Issues in Language Teaching (ILT)*, Vol. 1, No. 1, 123-158, June 2012
- [20] Suryakusuma, J. (2011). *State Ibuism: The Social Construction of Womanhood in New Order Indonesia*. Depok: Komunitas Bambu.
- [21] Talbot, M. (2003). Gender Stereotypes: Reproduction and Challenge. In *The Handbook of Language and Gender* (eds J. Holmes and M. Meyerhoff). <https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470756942.ch20>
- [22] Wertsch, J., V. (2002). *Voices of Collective Remembering*. Cambridge University Press.